

NOTE: Highlighted in yellow are the various action items that were identified from our discussions

February 24th, 25th 2017 – Strategic Plan Meetings
Utah Cultural Celebration Center

Present: Mayor Bigelow
Councilman Buhler
Councilman Huynh
Councilman Nordfelt
Councilman Christensen
Councilman Vincent
Councilwoman Lang

Staff: Wayne Pyle
Jim Welch
Paul Isaac

No members of the public attended.

Council members who arrived early had breakfast.

Meeting was called to order at 8:14 am.

Mayor Bigelow asked Mr. Pyle to begin discussions with a budget and policy update.

Jim began by discussing the economic forecasts. We have an appealing business climate in the state, growth is projected to be moderate, Utah is first in the nation in income growth at 5%, has the youngest population with a median age of 30.7, and strongest population growth. Mayor Bigelow asked if this forecast is similar to West Valley City rates. Where we lack is in the number of people with Bachelor's degrees ranking 16th in the nation. Mayor Bigelow asked if college education is probably due to the number of immigrants. The council discussed briefly the education problems in the State. Mayor Bigelow indicated that there is still a huge bias towards college education versus trade schools etc. Utah has larger households than the rest of the nation ranking 1st in household size. Jim spoke of the municipal cost index which included the construction costs index, consumer price index and the producer price index. Consumer confidence remains strong. The housing market continues to grow, the inflation rate was 1.5%, the fed is poised to raise rates again perhaps as much as 3/4% within the next year.

Jim then discussed the WVC budget. Current revenue projections. Budgeted revenue of \$75.7M, projected revenue of \$74.8M. Wayne commented that \$2.6M is for one-time projects,

1 million is fleet and 1 million is UCCC and 250K for unemployment reserve and 260K for other items. Jim mention the current fund balance is about 19%, with an expectation of going down to 16%. Mayor Bigelow mentioned that state law allows us to put money into an emergency reserve. Councilman Vincent commented that the property tax portion which comprises 37% seemed high. Wayne mention that in his opinion 37% is good in the sense that property tax is less volatile, more stable than sales tax, which as we have seen in the past, can be very volatile during economic downturns. Sales tax he said, has grown about 3.3% per year. Councilman Vincent said if we were to capture internet sales how much more could we collect. Wayne said there is a lot of variables effecting internet sales tax but we just don't know. Could range anywhere between 10-20%. Councilman Buhler commented that we need to be sensitive to this issue, we still want the brick and mortar stores but we don't want to give up on brick and mortar stores and not rely solely on internet sales. Councilman Vincent said when more and more brick and mortar stores sell more of their products on line and close retail outlets we want to concentrate on bringing those internet companies here like backcountry.com. Councilman Vincent said we need to capitalize on warehousing and internet sales. Wayne agreed that we need to continue to concentrate on those areas, Freeport area is a prime example. Councilman Vincent said it would be great to have those warehouses start to house internet sales. Mayor Bigelow said that we need to be flexible and determine if we should focus on property tax vs less sales tax etc. Mayor Bigelow is correct, we need to strategize more about how to affect this, Wayne said. Councilwoman Lang asked about Amazon. Jim said that Amazon would be allowed to keep 18% of the sales tax (internet sales) for administrative services under current law but that they negotiated their retention to 1% to the benefit of the state and municipalities. There is a bill to reduce that 18% collection. The distribution of sales taxes is 50% point of sale and 50% population. The formula is zip code plus 4. Saratoga springs will make out like bandits, Councilwoman Lang said. Is the agreement point of sale or point of delivery, Wayne asked. Councilman Huynh asked if we could get information about where internet sales are being generated so that it can be broken out by area. Councilman Huynh said he would like to know the numbers so that we can increase the percentage. Jim indicated that the information the city received is quite detailed and will give us a very good idea as to where these sales are coming from. The Economic Development Department performs this analysis to target important business areas. It is also protected information and not available for circulation per state law. Councilman Vincent said a great example on redwood road area when the Kmart closed. Jim warned that the sales tax information is confidential. Jim said we can lump business sectors or areas together for discussion purposes as long as businesses remain unidentifiable. Mayor Bigelow suggested we should have the numbers by industry. Revealing the detail would help us determine where we should focus our efforts. (INTERNET sales.) Unless the law changes sales tax is distributed on point of sale.

Jim mentioned that sales tax is much more volatile than property tax and is subject to wide swings depending on the health of the economy and consumer sentiment. Jim showed the slide on annual sales tax collections which showed the decline in 2008, with a loss of 5 million and we fully recovered in 2014 with projections in 2018 of 3.3% growth. Jim next spoke about property tax. Jim mentioned general, property, motor vehicle and prior year collections. Prior year collections have not been paid in previous years but then after 5 years or less it is collected

and included in our revenue. Some businesses withhold paying to take advantage of lower penalty rates of interest compared to the cost of borrowing. Late payments typically are paid current within 5 years to avoid a tax sale. Current property tax. The current property tax collection for this year is projected to be \$29.0M. Councilman Buhler wanted to show to the public the breakdown of the property tax by sector, and also the breakdown of real property to residential and commercial. Jim mentioned that there is a bill on the hill which would limit transfer of funds from enterprise funds. It is unlikely that this bill would have a significant impact on the City.

Councilwoman Lang discussed sidewalks being built out of storm water funds. Wayne mentioned that he thought that storm water funds were already being used for sidewalks and will examine this question further. Councilman Nordfelt asked about the increase in property tax. Jim indicated that it is illustrated and included in the fiscal year 2017 projections. Jim next discussed the Utility tax. Jim discussed the breakdown of the tax between cable TV, electricity tax, telephone tax and natural tax. Councilman Buhler asked if telephone tax includes cell phones. Jim said it does but home phone usage is declining and land lines are being replaced by cell phones at lower cost. Councilman Huynh said we ought to give the citizens an incentive to reduce that tax, like give them phone services. Mayor Bigelow said the whole issue of financing government is in turmoil. Jim said we have pledged revenue streams from sales and franchise taxes that need to be protected to preserve compliance with bond covenants.

Council took a break at 9:26 Council continued at 9:40 am

Jim next discussed expenditures within the City. Councilman Vincent asked about UTOPIA and Jim explained that that expense is in the non-departmental budget. Mayor Bigelow asked if Public works included storm water and sanitation in the general fund and Jim said no. Jim said the UTOPIA payment is around 4M and will go to about 6M when it levels off. The next largest expenses in non-departmental are transfers to the fitness center and Stonebridge golf course with 1 million for fleet purchases. We put about 1 million net into the maverick center and 800K for the cultural center.

Jim next discussed the cities overall debt. The council discussed the payment of the debt and the ratio that goes into installment debt. Jim discussed general obligation bonds and said that our current limit is around \$280M (Jim updated this number after the meeting, and it is now 330M). which is determined by the size of the budget. Wayne spoke about the capital facilities plan and how the wise use of debt helps to maintain facilities while minimizing the need to increase taxes. The discussion centered around how we make decisions related to taking on more debt. The city's debt load has remained relatively even around \$150M over the years. It is very illustrative to put all the debt together to see the trend. But if you take out the building authority and RDA debt this looks even better because the source of revenue to pay the BA and RDA debt includes other revenue sources. Councilman Huynh asked about what our total debt is now. Jim said it is around \$150M Mayor Bigelow said it might be helpful to take out the RDA so that we can show it staying around 150M. And we would not necessarily go into debt for the next three years so that we can stay under the 150m. Wayne mentioned that the only real

major decision that the council will need to make is when we build the public safety building. Councilman Vincent said we need to break it out even further to show which of the debt is not being covered by revenue from the project itself. Most debt has a dedicated revenue stream. Councilman Vincent mentioned that you really can't look at city debt the same as you do with household debt. Mayor Bigelow said that this very helpful to understand that we stay around the 150m and not going beyond 200m unless the payback period is very quick. Wayne said there is another way to look at it. When Wayne first got here we were building a lot of buildings and we spent a lot of time paying those down without doing a lot of construction. So now that we are going into the second generation of building you probably will not be doing a lot of building the next 10 or 20 years or so.

Wayne said he thinks we are very well positioned over the next several years even with the new bond debt. Councilman Buhler asked Mayor Bigelow if it would be beneficial to take the RDA out so that we can show the direct operational debt. Mayor Bigelow said he was appreciative of the presentation and he will need some time to think about it. Councilman Vincent said when you actually look at the needs of the City the buildings we are building now really take care of the needs of the city. Councilman Vincent asked about the battle going on in Bountiful and their new City Hall. Have we ever built a building by putting it on the ballot?

Mayor Bigelow said, I suggest that the city staff use as a general guideline that we use 150 million as a base and not go above 200 million and that if we do go over there is a short time frame of 5 years or less that we would get back down under. Councilman Buhler said that it sounds like that has been happening, since that it was we have been doing he sees no reason to not do that. Mayor Bigelow would also like to mention that we should limit debt service to 7% of general fund.

Councilman Nordfelt asked what our budget was compared to what was left over. Fiscal year 16/17 because of salary savings was about 1.5 million.

ATK Judgement Levy

Wayne began a discussion on the ATK Judgement levy. In August when the council is adopting the budget we have another large one-time judgement levy situation that we actually just found out about. There was a large judgement awarded to ATK reaching back to 1995. It has been in the court for a long time. ATK appealed the property tax value that they were being assessed for their equipment and land and they were awarded approximately 1.9 million. That money will be taken out of our revenues in fiscal 2018, from the taxes they normally give us. Obviously, that leaves us with a big hole. Last year we had about a \$400K judgement levy and this year the ATK judgement levy is \$1.9 million. We are not aware of any other appellants so we do not anticipate the levy going above \$2M total. Last year this was about 1.6% and the ATK levy represents about 7.4%. If the judgement levy we had last year is the same this year, then the judgement levy could be around 8%. Almost half of our property tax is from residential value and from centrally assessed value. We collect approx. 48% of revenue from residential value and 52% comes from business. We have not seen this large of a judgment levy

ever. Remembering that this is a one-time hit so property tax evaluation will stay the same along with the assessment we will be hit one-time for the 1.9 million and then it will bounce back up the next year, it is not ongoing.

Options are; We could not adopt the judgement level and take the 1.9 million hit from our reserves, which is what we did back in 2010 where ATK had a one time, \$1M judgement levy. Or, we could adopt the judgement level and spread it out over the entire tax base over a period of years, but we do not recommend that either. Third, through the legislative process we are trying to see if we could get some help from the legislature on a one-time basis to supplant the loss. Nicole Cottle is hoping we could get between 800K to 1M say from transportation funds. If we were able to do that at least we could reduce the net budgetary effect by around \$800K. The other thing we could do is go back to the county and say this is your fault and is there other revenue sources you could give to us on a one-time basis.

Mayor Bigelow asked if we do it this through the judgement levy and we do a onetime increase we would hold the public hearing and we would say we are going to increase property taxes for one year, 9% or so? Wayne added we would say this is what your portion of the shortfall will be at the residential level and this is what it will cost you. Mayor Bigelow said, so for a onetime tax you cause the same kind of anxiety or perception problem as you would have if you were to keep the tax increase permanently. Wayne said it is like giving residents of an HOA a one-time hit because they need to replace the roofs for example. Jim added that the dollar cost is about \$31.00 a year on the average home. Councilman Buhler added that the judgement levy is a different "line item" on the tax bill so one would only see it one time. Mayor Bigelow said the average home owner will say that we are raising our property taxes. Mayor Bigelow wanted to know if there was any way we could do the levy before we do our regular budget so it is not part of the regular budget discussion and other question is if we are going to pay the price to raise it one time, in terms of public perception, leave it in and don't raise property taxes for a few years and of course not go out and spend the whole thing away. If we did it Councilman Vincent added, that he would like to go back the following year and give it back. Mayor Bigelow said he remembers one time giving money back at the state level and it just made people mad. There is no upside to that option. This is a policy question. Mayor Bigelow said to see if there is a way it can be done before the budget discussion so it is not part of the budget process. But if it is part of the process then think about whether we pay the price of the tax increase once or again. Councilman Vincent said in the event we get a portion of it back then we take the other portion from the fund balance.

Mayor Bigelow said we could say to the public, in order for you to get the same level of service we must do the judgement levy. Mayor Bigelow was implying that we do a small tax increase every year to recover the judgement levy. Councilman Vincent said we do that every year. We have also said govt ought to be lien until we really have to raise taxes. Mayor Bigelow wants the citizens to know that their services do cost money;

The Council decided to table the discussion on police until later.

Councilman Vincent made a motion to break into an executive session to discuss real property, at 11:25. The motion was seconded by Councilwoman Lang.

Council broke for lunch at noon went to the Sizzler and reconvened at 1:25 pm

Mayor Bigelow welcomed every back and began the session.

Mayor Bigelow sent out a list of items to council many of the items will be passed over quickly others will be discussed in detail. Councilman Christensen said that in looking at the list of items that were sent out it seemed a little redundant. Talking about the same things over and over. He felt we should be thinking more about a strategic plan in moving ahead with some ideas rather than rehashing the same things every meeting. Mayor Bigelow said that is what he intends to try and accomplish.

Mayor Bigelow wanted to state his philosophy. He began by saying that each councilman was elected and each member has reasons why they are here. There are things that each member would like to see done for the people that elected them. Part of discussion is to highlight or talk about it and if reasonable get consensus from the other council members to move forward on it. For himself he said there are some things he has completed and some things he has not pertaining to goals he had as he began his tenure as Mayor.

Councilman Christensen said that he was just thinking that we ought to come out of this meeting with an actual plan, with a vision, so that as we talk about that in future meetings we can say, let's talk about our vision and see if it is still on track, for example city center. Councilman Lang said the City plan vision began in 1995. Mayor Bigelow mentioned there were 4 major goals that the council identified as their vision; Community, Economic Development, Neighborhood Development and Public Safety all of which were identified around 2013. Councilman Buhler said that even those four things are really never done, public safety for example includes a lot of different goals. Mayor Bigelow mentioned that in October of last year we even had more items added to the overall plan document. We came up with six items in that meeting. Councilman Buhler agreed with Councilman Christensen that we should take some direction from these items maybe go through it and check things off. He doesn't have anything new to add, but said that the biggest things that have been accomplished that took a long time to do was the housing standards and zoning. Those two items will have some long-lasting effects on the City and that was a long process which isn't finished its just kind of in flux. Councilman Lang added that sometimes we have to take steps a little at a time and then it has a more lasting effect. Councilman Buhler mentioned demographics and the discussions around education and the concern that our children do not live here after they graduate from High School. Councilman Lang agreed and it doesn't mean Hunter High doesn't put out quality students. Councilman Buhler commented that we just launch in to the discussion of the items on the list.

Mayor Bigelow began with UCCC. Several issues. March 15th will be the open house – open house. Instructions to staff as far as the Mayor Bigelow is concerned was to generate enough

revenue to cover the cost of operation. Generally, at a 50% level. Councilman Vincent said while he has heard that number thrown around a lot he remembers years ago, that the operations needed to be covered at 100%. Mayor Bigelow thought that it was mentioned in one of the study meetings and thought it might have even been Councilman Vincent that mentioned it. Councilman Vincent recalled that the discussion was that if we cannot get UCCC to fund itself let's just shut it down. Wayne mentioned that that was really early on and then a couple years later the discussion with council was do we want to shut it down or do we want to commit to a level of subsidy, and the Council at the time said yes, we will subsidize it to the tune of \$600. Wayne proceeded to assume that Council valued arts and culture within the arena of the UCCC to this level just like parks or other services and that is how we proceeded from a service standpoint. Councilman Vincent said that it seemed that in all those discussions there was always the caveat that there has to be a period of time that we would say if it doesn't happen then we would cease operations. He believes that that philosophy has never changed that at some point this operation had to be self-sustaining. Mayor Bigelow asked if the intent of the council today is that if the UCCC cannot sustain itself we should shut down the operation? Councilwoman Lang and Councilman Vincent said that after this last investment that is very difficult. Mayor Bigelow wanted to know what the goal is now. Councilwoman Lang said her goal was not to build out the basement, but she already lost that battle. She said somebody has got to work very hard to get the space rented out and we need someone who is really good at that to do it whether it is this staff or another staff.

Wayne mentioned that bookings for the center are beginning to increase. Councilwoman Lang mentioned that we have created a fee schedule to generate revenue. Paul Isaac mentioned that the staff has already generated about \$600,000 this year of which \$200,000 is a contribution from the County. Mayor Bigelow said that there are a couple of issues, one is money for Equipment, Chairs, tables etc., and is the staff sufficient for the operation. Paul Isaac commented that now the center is complete it can accommodate all kinds of multi functioning events.

Wayne is not counting on UCCC ever being able to meet the goal of covering the entire budget. The original business model was that it would cost about \$100,000 per year to operate this building. Which even right out of the gate did not withstand scrutiny. And once we started it was running a deficit right off the bat. It was clear within two or three years it would require major investment on the Cities part. Then Council around 2004 that they would put \$600,000 towards the center and Councilman Vincent was right that the intention was that if we could not eventually cover the budget other options should be explored. Council decided to match the construction grant but we will not even see results for another 2 years whether completing the space downstairs will have any serious effect covering the expense. County's contribution will end next year and whether they will continue to contribute into the future is yet to be determined. Instructions to staff is that we will have to come up with the money out of the existing budget to cover any FF&E we need.

Mayor Bigelow said if the intent is to rent it out it will cost us something. Councilwoman Lang said that Kevin Bruder at the Maverik Center know how to book these kinds of events so if they

can put more events in here would that be more sufficient. If the building would simply be handed over to Centennial Management would the council be fine with whatever level of activity would go on at the center and it is the kind of activity that the Council would want? Centennial for example is not going to pay staff to allow the dancers practice or allow the community to use the space for their activities.

Councilman Nordfelt mentioned that we are treating this like a business but we are not a business and therefore how can we utilize this building for the benefit of the Citizens of West Valley City. What can we do to MAKE it benefit our residences?

Wayne mentioned that even the issues of having concerts on the festival grounds is problematic because of our agreements with other partners like USANA. We need to cancel those concerts which conflict with our prior agreements. We are not taking business away from our business partner because they can get a cheaper price here and damage the relationship with Jim McNeil. We are not in the business with Competing with Jim McNeil for concerts. Even if they will not go to USANA anyway, our business partner says they would. We need to compliment groups who want to perform at the Amphitheater and at the Maverik Center but not the other way around and have them perform at UCCC, because frankly it upsets everything we have been trying to do.

Wayne has had conversations with USANA is reminded that we do have commitments to USANA. WVC controls the parking, we get money off the tickets and we have a business relationship with the company that runs USANA and we need to honor that commitment and if we don't he will not push shows to the maverick center that he would otherwise have done or he may also even sue us if we violate what he perceives to be our agreements with him. The problem is not contractual it is a partnership

In summary, the City Council will continue to subsidize the center with a \$600,000 subsidy and it may go to \$800,000 if we do not receive any additional money from Salt Lake County. The center will continue to operate with the resources we currently have and we will not do anything more here for the time being. The mission and community value will continue, Councilman Christensen called it the "flavor" of the Center, (Spirit of diversity) will continue and events that allow us to qualify for ZAP funding and other grants.

Mayor Bigelow also spoke to the Amphitheater and the need for sound and lights for better productions. Councilman Vincent felt that we need to improve the amphitheater and get on track with Sandy Amphitheater with respect to scheduling concerts while at the same time doing our due diligence with our business partners at USANA to ensure everyone is satisfied. Let's pursue smaller concerts in the Amphitheater 1500 people, and look at parking, restrooms and maybe some greenrooms back there so that we can operate the amphitheater. At the same time compliment what is going on at the river. If we can't use the festival grounds, then let's figure out what to do. Mayor Bigelow summarized by saying that there seems to be an interest of doing something out at the amphitheater to make it better for groups to perform there, so staff is to look at smaller groups of up to 1500 people. Staff was asked to find out what would we need in the way of sound, lighting, restrooms, parking, stage surface, replace

grass area with seats, etc., and come back to council with a proposal of capital needed, including the stage surface and the orchestra pit. What would it take to produce enough revenue to cover the costs over a period of time? If amphitheater parking was tied to the festival grounds and UCCC parking in the existing parking lot. Mayor Bigelow said we need to request this for TRCC purposes. TRCC does not pay for parking. Councilman Christensen also desired that the Chinese Gate be lighted and requested staff to come back to Council with a proposal of costs. Mayor Bigelow also would like to know what the cost would be to put seats on the grassy area at the Amphitheater.

Council discussed “family concerts, and alcohol” and concluded that it is what it is all other venues sell alcohol or have concerts for certain crowds and citizens can choose what they want to attend.

Mayor Bigelow asked about the Fitness Center and whether the council had issues, one comment was to make sure we get the AC fixed.

Mayor Bigelow asked if there were concerns at the Golf Courses – no comment

Mayor Bigelow asked about UTOPIA. Councilman Buhler asked if the operations are in the black? Wayne explained that UTOPIA was operating in the black on both the UIA and UTOPIA operations side and while UIA is in the black on the debt service side the UTOPIA debt service is still underwater and will be for the foreseeable future. Mayor Bigelow asked about the bond proceeds to build out some areas and had that been depleted? Wayne said there is still funding but it will be depleted by years’ end. Mayor Bigelow wondered if the City Manager would be coming back to the council with a proposal to go forward near the end of the year. Wayne explained that he has asked the Executive Director of UTOPIA to give the Council a presentation sometime in March, but also reported that under the current funding stream that we have we would not need City backing for further infrastructure extension. The Council’s input is needed to answer the philosophical questions of how we are proceeding but there is no intent to ask for fund the debt unless as a City the council decided that you were not satisfied with the current speed of the build. The net result is that it is possible to have the city built out without further commitment in about 10 years. The organization would continue to incur additional debt but basically the debt payment is being covered by the additional revenue we are taking on. Very good position.

Councilman Huynh asked about the Golf courses and wanted to know how much we spend each year. Wayne explained that although the parks director said that we were running a deficit operationally he needs to discuss that further with Kevin Astill because he thought we were close to break even on a year to year basis. On the Stonebridge side, we are still very highly subsidized to the tune of about \$1M a year due to the debt service. After the debt service is paid we should be pretty close to breakeven.

Mayor Bigelow asked Wayne to get the subsidy information on the two golf courses and also verify the subsidy for UCCC and the Maverik Center as well, within the next few weeks just as a report not for a study session.

Mayor Bigelow asked about the Police Dept. and traffic enforcement. Wayne had indicated earlier that the traffic unit was back up and staffed. Councilman Buhler asked if we were seeing results yet and Councilwoman Lang asked if Wayne had a report ready that she had asked for. Councilwoman Lang asked if we could provide her with a report that shows who gets tickets and who pays for their tickets. Councilwoman Lang's major concerns are the numbers of people who do not show a valid driver's license or ID and therefore don't pay the ticket. Wayne had given instructions to the Chief to staff the traffic unit by the middle of November, with 10 officers including leadership staff. Since that time, we have one month showing improvement. January was \$219,000 vs \$205,000 the same time last year which is still under the average of the past several years. But we are starting to show improvement.

Mayor Bigelow asked if the City Manager could give them a report once a month of the activity of the traffic unit in Council meeting.

Councilwoman Lang asked some questions regarding police training. It appears that the training budget has decreased but we have so many new officers how is it that we are spending less? Wayne explained that perhaps what was happening is in previous years we may have actual paid more or the "spike" was because we are now back with the original budget. Councilwoman Lang wanted assurances that we were providing enough training. Wayne explained that any time there are strains on the budget everything is looked at to cut costs including training.

Councilman Huynh asked about recruiting of Police officers and the need to even go outside of the State for qualified candidates. He is concerned that if we are becoming a training ground for officers and as soon as they are able they leave for more money to other cities. He gave an example of officers leaving to West Jordan for example. Wayne explained that our recruiting area has been greatly expanded. Councilwoman Lang wondered if there could be something done at the legislature to stop the constant flow of officers leaving. The larger cities are picking up all the training costs. Mayor Bigelow also said we could minimize that by putting in an incentive plan where the officer would have to stay here, 5 years, in order to receive the incentive.

Mayor Bigelow discussed photo radar. He said Photo radar is legal in Utah in School Zones, and anywhere where the speed limit is 30 miles an hour or less. It is also legal on any street including Bangerter Highway if several conditions are met. An officer is present, if it is posted that the driver knows he/she is approaching photo radar. Councilman Buhler wondered if photo radar can actually be effective on Bangerter Highway with four lanes. Mayor Bigelow said cost is between \$2000-\$5000. Council discussed all the details about photo radar, including contracts. Last year the Council approved two. Wayne reviewed the state code regarding the use of photo radar with the Council. The main point Wayne made is that you can have photo

radar but a police officer has to be present. From a philosophy standpoint, does Council want the administration to proceed understanding that an officer will be needed? Council discussed how to proceed, whether to just do a few, the work involved by the officer, what to do in school zones, what to do in multi-jurisdiction. Wayne did not know whether or not in the past when the city had photo-radar that it was effective in reducing speed but it was effective in producing tickets. Councilwoman Lang thought it was worth doing in a school zone. Mayor Bigelow agreed that school crossing safety is a high priority. It was suggested that the City purchase two camera's and we have an officer and a sign that notifies the driver that they are in a photo radar zone and move those from time to time to different school zones and then put fake cars where there is no longer the radar to slow down the traffic. Mayor Bigelow also agreed with the concept. Mayor Bigelow also indicated he was going to see if the language of the code could be strengthened or clarified.

Council took a break at 3:00 pm and reconvened at 3:10 pm

Mayor Bigelow asked the council if there were any instructions for the City Manager on the photo radar issue. It was concluded that in a school zone all of criteria had to be present. Councilman Buhler thought that we ought to ask the police their opinion if they in fact they have to be present. Councilman Nordfelt we are to just get one and see how it works. The council decided to put one photo radar in a school zones and move it around even into the residential areas where the speed limit is 30 miles or less. And encourage the police department to monitor particularly the school zones.

Mayor Bigelow asked what could be done to show more of a police presents in the neighborhoods and staffing the police department. Mayor Bigelow desires to use "growth" money to hire more people, whether it be a retired officer who works part time, is it cadets or trainings who are a pool for future officers, regardless we start adding some people even if it is only a few. Mayor Bigelow asked council if they should instruct Wayne to give them a report of the options they might have on this request. Councilman Vincent said he would like staff to look in to the possibility of adding a part time group to the department. Look at cadets, retired officers and the reserve program to see if we can better serve the citizens and get more visibility in the neighborhood and what impact it would have on our funding if we earmarked some of the growth to this cause. Councilman Huynh wanted to know how many officers we would need. Mayor Bigelow responded that if we hire a non-certified officer the council would rely on Wayne to tell them what that particular person would do, whether it is to help out with traffic, assisting with taking reports etc. Mostly neighborhood stuff, the things they could do without weapons. They would also have to have a vehicle of some kind.

Mayor Bigelow wondered how we could engage the citizens more effectively on the budget, maybe do a "Citizens guide to budget" dashboard or something just to teach them how it works. Wayne asked if he could use Jim's citizen's report to accomplish this. Mayor Bigelow will review the document to see if it could be used.

Council discussed Metro Business Park area with respect to continued clean up, the UTOPIA sign, renaming the business park.

Mayor Bigelow brought up the West Valley Library – Mayor Bigelow said that it had been suggested to him to build the veterans hall in conjunction to a library. There was a general discussion about the pro’s and cons of having the library there so close to Fairbourne station and the environment that is being created there.

Councilman Buhler asked Mayor Bigelow if he had selected a sight for the veteran’s hall. Mayor Bigelow commented that he was negotiating with the City right now. Mayor Bigelow said that the board agreed to go with the WVC sight at Stonebridge golf course.

Mayor Bigelow commented that he and other Mayors were beginning to discuss issues in their respective Neighborhoods. Mayor Bigelow said we have done our due diligence but what can we do with existing neighborhoods to spruce them up. Councilman Vincent said we were doing somethings like helping them change the look of their homes etc. Wayne said that we took some initial steps to engage the neighborhoods where we had these plans to assist. The first neighborhood said no, in the second neighborhood area they were a little more accepting but still no takers. We then moved to the “idea house”. We are still doing that. Councilman Buhler requested an update on the progress of the “idea house”. Mayor Bigelow said clearly, we cannot afford to build 30 homes but asked what could we do to encourage families to take care of their homes? For example, some of the water companies help families save money on water. They don’t pay for it but they encourage them by way of information, how to landscape their properties. He would like to see that in the clean and beautiful committee as a category. He asked Wayne to think of some ways to encourage people to take care of their homes. Mayor Bigelow wanted to know if we could give neighbors money to do some beautification of their homes or tie them to the clean and beautiful committee. Could we do a test on that Mayor Bigelow asked? It has to be something that would benefit the entire neighborhood not just the one individual. Mayor Bigelow said maybe we should start with seniors.

Mayor Bigelow brought up code repeat offenders, what do we do with them. Councilman Vincent said if you have people who flat out ignore it then all we can do is put liens on the property. Wayne said we are not giving up but it is still a pretty intractable problem. When we do get tougher we run other risks. Wayne said we always say we are not here to collect money we are trying to get compliance.

Councilman Vincent still has the desire to pursue a homebuilder who is willing to build a sustainable neighborhood. He said that he would be willing to reduce the size of the home and the lot size especially if they would be willing to do that. Wayne said that Garbett did a neighborhood in day break that the council could go take a look at. Wayne said they did full solar panel roofs and rated as full energy starter homes. Wayne asked Councilman Vincent to point him in the right direction or provide him with some sources or homebuilders who are doing building these types of sustainable neighborhoods. Councilman Nordfelt suggested building an apt. high-rise close to City Center with the same kinds of sustainability. Mayor

Bigelow asked if there is a way to provide some incentives to developers if they were willing to building energy efficient residences? Councilman Vincent said the standards are out there and council could enforce developers to build.

Councilman Huynh talked about the chesterfield community center and was appreciative of the Erickson's who are getting more involved. His desire is to get others involved as well. Councilman Vincent wondered if perhaps they had the desire to volunteer for some of the committees we have form in the City or asking neighborhood services to assist. Councilman Christensen thought that they could be the nucleus for a Chesterfield neighborhood council. **Wayne was asked to see if a community group already existed there.** Councilman Vincent thought there might be.

Councilman Lang brought up the issue of cars parking on the streets during snow storms and wondered about towing them. Wayne reviewed the snow removal procedures including things that are currently in policy such as, no vehicle parks on street while there is an accumulation of snow, or the vehicle cannot remain on the street more than 72 hours. Councilman Huynh said there are many streets that cars are no removed. Wayne asked the Councilman to provide him addresses and he would check up on that. Mayor Bigelow asked do we want to be doing more than we are doing or are we doing everything we can. Councilman Vincent said he was kind of on the fence regarding ticketing people. Mayor Bigelow said if start towing people there will be some mad people. Councilwoman Lang said that there are some places where we really need to do better. Mayor Bigelow wanted to know of those we issue parking tickets to for these kinds of violations are they being paid. Mayor Bigelow wanted to discuss future road widths. Councilman Vincent said perhaps if we could make the setbacks larger more people could park in their drive ways. **Council asked Wayne to bring back a report regarding what the planning implications would be for narrower roads with deeper setbacks in newer neighborhoods.**

Mayor Bigelow talked about sidewalk repair, Wayne said he would be doing a presentation for council. Wayne said we do take it seriously dependent on the resources we have.

Next, Mayor Bigelow brought up or asked the council if they had any issues regarding "going green" or recycling, solar, air quality and urban forestry and environmental efforts. Wayne discussed with council some of the incremental successes we have been having in these areas, but wanted to spend time thinking about how to benchmark successes and obtain even better data regarding these issues. He indicated that progress has been made with creating partnerships with Rocky Mountain Power for example, and he has engaged Laura Lewis and her firm to also assist us. Councilman Vincent said he was uncomfortable with outside firms and wondered why we could not just use the power company. His concern was that any savings we would get from energy efficient projects would just go back to the companies as fees.

Wayne also talked about Solar. He gave an example of many homes in WVC using solar even in the older neighborhoods. Councilman Vincent said people need to make sure they read their contracts before they buy from some of the solar companies. Wayne said WVC and the State are really close at working out a lot of the details regarding solar, some more hurdles to cross

but solar seems to be taking root in WVC. More effort is also needed in teaching our residents regarding recycling and perhaps we need to distribute even more “blue can’s” around the City

Meeting was adjourned at 5:00 pm, Motion made by Councilman Buhler seconded by Councilman Nordfelt

Council and staff went to Shula’s for dinner.

February 25, 2017

Strategic Plan Meeting

Present: Councilman H
Councilman C
Mayor Bigelow B
Councilman V
Councilwoman L
Councilman B
Councilman N

Staff: Wayne Pyle
Paul Isaac

No members of the public were invited.

Mayor Bigelow began discussions by referring to Councilman Christenson’s remarks of yesterday that the Council was looking at a lot of details but wanted to spend some time on the overall vision. Mayor Bigelow referred to an email that he had sent out to the City Manager which outline the general overall vision defined pre-2014, another which was identified subsequent to that vision and yet another that was developed last fall (October 2016). Mayor Bigelow said that he had compared them and although they were similar for the most part there were also some differences. He wanted the Council to review his email and then make a comment on whether or not the council agreed with those priorities or did they want to remove any, or change any.

Councilman Buhler joined the session at this point in the discussion.

Mayor Bigelow noticed that the council in October did not include direction on transportation and education, or placemaking. He asked if there was any modification to the overall broader instructions the council gave the City Manager in October. Councilman Christenson said that the council may want to define it first. For example, what does safety and security mean? Councilwoman Lang said that means a policeman on every corner. Mayor Bigelow said he had the question on education because it seemed it was a priority of the council but there was not a

lot done with it last time. Councilwoman Lang asked, “what if any control did the City Council have over Education”? She said that in the past the City Council had assisted the charter school by assisting them with their debt and beyond that with the after-school programs in support of Margaret Peterson. Mayor Bigelow said that they could have some input or influence outside of the school room but not inside where the school board makes the decisions. After School, before School and early childhood education could be areas where the Council could have some influence, he said. Mayor Bigelow said that he was in South Salt Lake recently where he learned of a program where they had reached out to immigrant groups by helping them get ready for school and prepare for college. Councilman Buhler indicated that the Council also championed the English as a second language initiative. Councilwoman Lang added the after-school programs at the Fitness center as well. Mayor Bigelow just wanted to know if the Council wanted to elevate Education on this list of priorities as one of the major objectives in addition to what was on the list? The same with Transportation.

Councilman Lang said, that she wondered if we should just get with UTA and encourage them to better serve our community. She mentioned for example that they should be stopping at the junior highs when the students are getting out of school. It seemed that UTA didn’t care about that so maybe as a council we could influence the UTA in that way. Mayor Bigelow mentioned that Senator Mayne was pushing that at the legislature level.

Councilman Huynh mentioned that a few months ago, he ran into the directory of the community college out on 5600 west and they would like to expand more in that area and wonder if staff could help the school expand in that area. Councilman Vincent wondered if the City was helping them re-locate in the City Center zone eventually. Wayne said that staff has had a number of different discussions with the college about relocating in the city. The college has not committed to relocate to any particular place in the city.

Councilman Christensen referring to the Mayor Bigelow’s email to council on the list of areas said that he thought that need not be part of the strategic plan but rather keep them mind. The staff is already working with our educational institutions to try and bring them in to the city. The issue on the bus routes is the same, if the buses can’t get down our streets then UTA will not put a bus route down them. Wayne did say in his discussions with UTA’s Executive Director, that they are trying to reevaluate the bus routes etc. focus more on existing operations rather than expanding them. Mayor Bigelow indicated that UTA did not respond favorably to Senator Mayne’s bill because of lack of funding. Mayor Bigelow said the issue is, “Is there a part of SL valley that is underserved and if so what is UTA going to do about it”. They need to demonstrate it. Mayor Bigelow re-emphasized that these are just points where the council could add input.

Councilman Buhler said the list is inclusive however on the 2016 list, taxation and budget, environment these are things we really are not going to do anything new with them. The others we need to have a constant focus. Councilman Nordfelt agreed with respect to taxation and the budget, but the environment is really important to Councilman Nordfelt and he would

like to see a continued focus. Councilwoman Lang said like what we are doing with solar and other green issues which were previously talked about. Mayor Bigelow said that everything in the City is driven by the budget and whatever we do it should be reflected in the budget. The focus areas remaining, that Council wanted to focus on were Economic Development, Environment, Safety and Security.

Councilwoman Lang said that she would like to address an issue in economic development. She suggested that three or four members of council should work with Nicole Cottle and Wayne as we bring in new economic initiatives. For example, when Councilman Vincent spoke up about the medical center and the fact that it was completed according to the council's vision but it was too late to do anything about it because the designs had already been completed. So, having a 3-member council assist with these projects in the very beginning with the Public safety building and the other building projects we are undertaking and make sure Staff has more direction from the elected officials rather than the elected officials being shock after it is completed. She understands that there are certain things that cannot be revealed but 3 members of council and be taken into that confidence and frankly able to keep their mouths shut.

Wayne said his concern with how we would set up something like that is not the confidentiality issue it is really wrapping our heads around the type of projects the committee would want to look at and at what depth and how much time would that take. Councilwoman Lang said maybe the CED is bringing in companies or businesses that we do not want, although those coming in so far have been just fine in certain areas such as the mercades company. But other companies they are bringing in may not be as good for the city as CED does. They may be thinking something entirely different than the elected officials, like the elected officials may say we want to be more than just a truck stop for example. Councilman Christensen said having a committee of elected officials may give more "political clout" to the discussions. For example, having Councilman Vincent go down to talk to the folks at Cedar City regarding Hale center theater. Wayne has felt that that has not been necessary in the past it hasn't kept us from bringing in businesses that we have wanted to bring in so there is some hesitancy to add yet another layer of "talks" to the process. Maybe from the review concept that Councilwoman Lang is talking about. And as to the concern would staff bring in businesses that the council would not want, those issues have already been defined in the economic development plan. Trucking industry for example is to stay in that area. We would not bring in a warehousing entity that the council would have much concern about. Wayne asked the council if they were familiar with the economic development plan and felt strongly that the CED department under the City Manager's direction is doing what the Council desires. If you're not familiar with it then we need to provide you more opportunities to become familiar with it, because that plan is constantly and consistently in the minds of our economic development people.

Councilwoman Lang said the company that moved into the old Mervyns footprint is an example of something in her mind that was totally inappropriate to bring to the City. She didn't care how much of a tax base that brought in, nor was the incentive worth it. We should have just dropped them like a hot potato the councilwoman said. Councilwoman Lang continued by saying that this committee does not have to be at every meeting but just be given enough

information to help staff make a determination as to whether to proceed or not and take into consideration whether it is going to be a harsh use, will it be hard on the neighbors, could it be in a different place. Going back to the plan and not even disagreeing with the Councilwoman's opinion the property in question was zoned appropriately and fits right into the conceptual plan the council adopted for that area. The city manager point was that because everything was properly done according to the plan, in other words staff was following council's directive what advantage would the committee have in that situation? They would be asserting themselves into the economic process without the full approval of the council which we have always been very careful of because it can lead to losing deals, to liability and litigation like we are experiencing right now with the property just to the south. Councilwoman Lang continue to suggest that the screening process is very important however. The City Manager believes that the council has already been given, through study sessions, individual one on one discussions the level of screening that Councilwoman Lang is suggesting and frankly council agrees in 99% of the cases, so the question is does the council feel that they need more and does the entire council or at least four of the council feel we need that other layer or not. Mayor Bigelow said has he has been listening to the conversation and concludes that on one hand it is simply a matter of information flow, keeping the council informed at what types of development opportunities are we looking at maybe using executive sessions etc. Councilman Buhler said while he would like to get it into an executive session those are strictly for acquiring property and Wayne mention most of the deals we make are not acquiring property. The other point Mayor Bigelow was trying to make was that once the deal starts to come together and it looks like it is going to happen and how will it impact the city, the elected officials should be informed. More just keeping the council updated. Councilwoman Lang referred to Granger Medical and said when the plans were brought forward that they were going out instead of up it was a surprise to the council. Councilman Vincent said that we have a zone at City center that requires six stories and at what point during the discussion with economic development did they determine we were only going to four stories. He could not remember whether a discussion had been had with the council on that change. Wayne responded that the zone is not 6 stories it is a minimum of 5 and it is 5 and so we would not have had the discussion with council because we had already met the minimum requirements that the Council had required. But whether I am right on that issue or not Wayne said, if the council is uncomfortable with that then obviously, he would change whatever is necessary to make the Council comfortable. Ninety-nine times out of a hundred we have been fine which is a huge success and win. Granger Medical is a beautiful bldg., it is bringing in all kinds of economic development, its keeping our medical professionals in our city. To use that as an example as to why we need to have a committee or add another layer to the process is Wayne's point. Do we need a committee to decide over this marginal difference of whether it should be 6 stories or 5? Councilman Vincent feels that he does not want to be as involved as to what Councilwoman Lang is talking about, elected officials are not paid employees of the city but he does feel like more information is needed so when something does happen the elected officials are in the dark about it . . . and the information has to be early enough in the process so that if change is needed it can be recommended. Councilman Buhler had similar feelings. Wayne added that we have had this discussion in the previous strategic plan meetings and feels that we have made progress in providing the information about on-going projects. Staff has tried to be very sensitive to that

request and frankly has not brought major new projects (like current Fairbourne project) forward until Council was updated both informally or formally in study session or one on one. As a side note Councilman Buhler did believe that we did know it was going to be 5 stories. Wayne brought up the tower and the auxiliary buildings that will only be 4 stories. Wayne said, in the first place, preparation's and discussions with Council have been going on for years and it was apparent that Council wanted staff to make the deal. In staff's mind buy off had already been achieved. Mayor Bigelow talked about his experience with EDCU, how they would assign a project an arbitrary name, talk about the type of business it was and some general factors and it seemed to work very well. Wayne thought that might be a good idea combined with our "what's in the pipeline" concept that could be simple and as long as the council was comfortable in defining what the general knowledge consists of, and we didn't get into the details. Mayor Bigelow agreed, it's a matter of how much the council wants to see of the pie. Probably the bigger the project the more likely the council wants to be involved. Wayne agreed and the issue will be that line. Council may not care about a sandwich shop but a project like Fairbourne – absolutely. Councilman Vincent said he wasn't as concerned with what happens on 5600 west as he is with Fairbourne for example. Councilman Vincent said we have learned our lesson with how much we should be involved with other projects and we cannot get that involved again. So, information early is great and the Mayor Bigelow's example of how they did it at EDCU. Mayor Bigelow said its information we are after, not approval of work even if it is a sandwich shop, it's just interesting information. Wayne said that half the time we could be giving you information about projects that will never happen. Councilwoman Lang said it is difficult to get the council to see it before it comes to them in a public meeting but they would like as much information as possible prior to the public meeting. Mayor Bigelow said it is not the intent of the council to get into the detail of the job of staff it is more just a matter of informing the council, even when we lose opportunities. If the Council is aware the Council can perhaps be a position to ensure that City staff has the resources they need. Councilwoman Lang said we do not want to sit down with any developer. But for example, if the city needed "political clout" they are free to ask Council for assistance.

Wayne agreed that asking questions such as "Are we doing the right thing", with respect to development opportunities. Mayor Bigelow said let's try it for a while and include the Council more in the information flow. Councilman Lang said what about the fire stations that we are already at the design stage and the council is not aware. Wayne said that his concerned is that it is his job to bring projects along and ensure that council will be okay with the decisions. Council should have enough confidence in the City Manager and staff to allow the project to be brought along without a review by council. Councilman Buhler said the Council has control anyway because they the council controls the budget. Councilman Buhler mentioned however that we don't need more involvement and perhaps we need to say no. Example is that staff thinks and ponders over something for months and then brings it to council and expects council to vote on it in just a few days. Mayor Bigelow said that the Council wants information quicker. Wayne feels he is already doing that but will continue to find ways to ensure the Council is satisfied. Wayne brought up the fairbourne project with the public safety building and the office tower. It's one building. Is it still one building when there is 12 feet between them and one is 4 stories and the other is 7 stories? Is the Council now saying that that is something they

wouldn't approve because as far as he and the direction he has given to staff the project is moving ahead as planned. Mayor Bigelow said if it is something new then the council needs to hear about the changes and more constructive feedback. Wayne said that that process can work with public works and parks buildings because it's an internal project, and not really that critical as to time constraints. However, projects with development partners is much more subject to time constraints and would not be as practical. Mayor Bigelow said that the City manager doesn't have to get with everyone just a few. Wayne thinks that that is exactly what he is doing. Councilman Vincent said he would never tie staff down, because design and development, plans are very dynamic. A good example is holding cells or no holding cells. Councilman Buhler said we do not need a committee but just keep us more informed in the process.

The direction of the Council is that they do not want to do a committee and look to Wayne to include the Council in the pipeline beginning with what projects are coming into the City, what projects leaving and when a project is good and when it is not.

Councilman Huynh brought up the Sister City and wants to continue relationships with Asia, Councilman Vincent said Mexico made more sense if we do anything at all.

Councilman Nordfelt would like us to do more with our volunteer committees and when we select or appoint chairs we need to train them better in how to lead, conduct meetings. Etc.

We will disband CAB and try to find a way to get volunteers and begin anew.

The Council decided to move to an executive session to discuss litigation.

Executive Session to discuss potential litigation at 10:15 motion was made by Councilman Christensen and seconded by Councilman Buhler.

Executive Session closed at 10:45 motion by Councilman Nordfelt seconded by

Homeless Discussion Minutes

Mayor Bigelow began the discussion by saying that getting a homeless person into housing is a very difficult problem. If were easy Pamla Atkinson would have succeeded at it a long time ago, he said. The Mayor Bigelow said that the Council supports any effort to solve the problem and he said that he was not interested in "painting it a different color", or just putting window dressing on the problem that doesn't really change anything. We don't want to waste taxpayer money on "feel good" solutions that do not change it, he said. If there are things that are working, then the Council of course could support those efforts. There is a genuine desire on the part of the Council and the Administration to "help these people." But Mayor Bigelow indicated that our City was not in the position to provide mental health services, or treatment programs for substance abuse, those programs should be handled at the County or State Level. Wayne added that the thing we need to emphasize along those lines is that sometimes the problem with providing those services attract even more homeless people into our area. Wayne said that as a City of course we will support the existing services and existing structure in place but the

solution is not to necessarily increase the services in West Valley City. Wayne added that we can be flexible and have been flexible in the past. But we do not want to suggest to the County or the State that we can solve the problem by saying to them that we will provide the services. Mayor Bigelow gave an example of his experience in Mexico City. Essentially, he said that there were millions of people who lived in homes without water or electricity and no sanitary facilities thus every used the restroom outside. When the dry season came and the wind blew people were effected with possible disease. They decided to try and fix the problem by providing electricity and water to all those people. The effect was that all the people living without electricity began moving to the areas where they did have the services and the problem became worse. Some people were helped but they did not focus on a real solution to the problem. Mayor Bigelow said he sees this same thing happening in West Valley. He mentioned that he saw people using the restroom outside. We can't solve the problem by just providing more and more services because as we do the more people will come here even from other states. Wayne mentioned that that is what the west coast is experiencing right now. They are welcoming them in and the climate adds to the problem. Mayor Bigelow indicated he would champion any solution that works. There are too many solutions that sound good on paper and make me feel that I have done something but have not addressed the problem, he said.

Wayne also mentioned that just because it seems there is no solution on the horizon it doesn't mean that Wayne and the staff are not looking for or hoping for a solution. We are still trying to find a solution but he is trying hard not to be in the position of being the experimental "test tube" and have a worse situation that we have had before which in a lot of ways is what is happening to our Sister City to the northeast. Mayor Bigelow said that some people say that it is West Valley City's problem too. But the Council feels it is an exported problem, they are not our residents.

Wayne asked if the Council might be interested in some pictures he has taken of several areas where the problems are and showed them to the Council. The Council was very concerned. And in essence Wayne said that as result of efforts being made by the Wayne and the staff, it is being cleaned up and people are moving on. However, they continue to move to different spots. So, it's not solving the problem long term. Mayor Bigelow indicated that the Staff is really trying to educate the Council on this problem. Mayor Bigelow suggested that perhaps we summarize and post on our web site some of this information to help educate the public. Wayne agreed that perhaps that would be something we could do. Part of the issue or strategy is to determine how vocal or how long we should sort of fly under the radar on this issue, and how long do we want to. When is the appropriate time to start educating or coalescing our own population? Councilman Huynh asked if things were getting better and Wayne briefed the council on some of things we have done. Wayne mentioned that our next area is down along 3900 south, where he said the situation or cleanup situation is much worse, debris is much worse for example. When the snow melts, it will not be habitable anyway.

Councilman Christensen left the meeting at 11:15.

Councilman Huynh thanked Wayne for the discussion on the homeless.

The Mayor Bigelow made a remark that as he prepared the list of discussion items he thought about what all cities have that define them as a city. He mentioned a Jail, their own cemetery etc.

Wayne commented that this issue was discussed as the city contemplated putting a holding cell in the public safety building. The question was while it is really expensive to provide a jail or holding cells

shouldn't the City with our needs at least consider it? Councilwoman Lang said that she blames the legislature even more than the county sheriff for allowing law breakers to go free. They had changed a lot of the felonies to misdemeanors and thus they can't go to jail. You still could but policy is that they won't Buhler said. The problem it seems that we are allowing too many crimes to become common place because there is not enough room to put them anywhere. Wayne said that our holding cells will never really become a jail but Mayor Bigelow asked if it were possible to turn a storm water retention area into a cemetery. Council commented on that suggestion.

Councilwoman Lang wanted to understand the policy on take home vehicles. Council discussed policies on personal use on and off the job and wanted to ensure that the city staff was doing all we could to reduce mileage on City vehicles. They also discussed IRS reporting rules, insurance and liability issues and policies on transporting family members. Council expressed the desire to have the City Manager review vehicle use and take home policies and report back on how much it costs to insure employees and if possible what is reported on W-2's. Wayne mentioned that we have people who drive city vehicles who are on call and are not allowed to use the vehicle for personal use. He said, we also have employees who are allowed limited personal use meaning they can have a family member in the car who is dropped off on the way to work. The other end of the spectrum of course is the City Manager, Department Heads who have the option of a car or car allowance and the two Chiefs. Wayne mentioned that personal mileage is reported to the Finance Department and is available for review. Wayne appreciated the Council's concerns and questions and at any time the Council wanted to make a change in policy he would welcome the input. The current policy on vehicle use was then reviewed by council. Mayor Bigelow indicated they were not concerned with incidental use but excessive use. Council also wanted policies to reflect the principle of reducing mileage on vehicles and on personal use unless otherwise addressed in policies and procedures, contracts or as part of employees compensation. Mayor Bigelow said the issue was about making sure we have documentation. Wayne assured Council that policies were in place and that we are following those policies and guidelines. Wayne said that he instructed the finance department to review other policies as well like the credit card/pcard policies, receipts, etc. to ensure that proper receipting and reconciliation is being done. Councilman Buhler indicated that he was pleased at the direction the state auditor has taken. Councilwoman Lang commented that she just wanted to make sure things were in place, procedures were being followed, etc. Councilwoman Lang asked the City Manager to have the City Attorney give some training or instruction on the protocols the state auditor needs to go by whenever they engage with an elected official or an employee.

Mayor Bigelow asked if we do bonuses. Wayne explained the policy regarding use of incentive pay. He asked if the Council was comfortable with the way he was doing his job. Mayor Bigelow asked about the largest bonus he has given out. Ans. \$15,000. It is all documented and written up and put into the personnel file. Mayor Bigelow asked if there was a policy. Mayor Bigelow commented and wanted to go on record regarding the investigation into Mike Jensen and said that he people should withhold judgement on his case until it is resolved. The actual language in policy was read for the record indicating the City Manager was authorized to pay bonuses or other incentive pay to employees. Mayor Bigelow wondered if the City Manager should inform the Council when large bonuses are given and asked the City Manager to use good judgement as to when to inform the council and he specifically indicated that neither he or the council wanted to make their involvement part of an approval process. Mayor Bigelow said that the bonus policy is okay and effective and encouraged the City Manager to

continue the policy and ensure that whenever possible that employees are complying with that policy and the spirit of the policy. The Council asked the City Manager when they ask questions if policies exist to review them tell them what the current policies are as a reminder.

Councilman Huynh asked if it were possible to put car ports along the credit union side of the city hall parking lot so that City vehicles could be parked in there. Wayne said he would like to see that happen however it is an expense and frankly if the council authorized the money he would rather re surface the entire parking lot. Councilwoman Lang mentioned an alternative to fixing pot holes the regular way by taking an idea from a guy who turns pot holes into pieces of art, a great place making idea.

Mayor Bigelow reminded the Council that he is allowed the use of city vehicle, and told the Council that if any of them wished to use the car it is available to them as well. Councilman Huynh reiterated his request for a car port and Mayor Bigelow said that if money is made available that only City cars could park there. Mayor Bigelow expressed an opinion that all city employees should park in the back stalls of the parking lot. Councilwoman Lang was pleased that the 30-minute parking stalls that she recommended was very effective. Wayne mention it was working very well. Mayor Bigelow said he wished that the cement barriers be removed on some of the stalls and was told that it was a safety issue and employees are encouraged to back into those stalls so that they can drive straight out.

Councilman Huynh asked how long the 4-day per week policy had been in place. Wayne said that the policy has been in place since 2000 and it has worked very well, improving morale and improving our competitive advantage and retention. All vital services are being provided for on the 5th day. Wayne mention the advantages to our employees and very little complaints have been filed by citizens. Mayor Bigelow said there were pro's and con's and mentioned the State's experience and said employees are working 4-10's anyway because everyone is flexing their schedules. Mayor Bigelow said he did not believe we should ever take it away but allow flexibility. It is a real benefit for the employees and the city.

Mayor Bigelow told the Council that while he intends to review everything that had been talked about yesterday and today there was really only one major issue that he has and that is the police department. Specifically, he wants more people hired, whether they be full time officers, cadets, part time officers. He made the Council aware that whenever budget is going to be discussed that he will bring up his desire to hire more police personnel. It is the issue he is concerned about "far and above anything else." Councilwoman Lang asked if the Mayor Bigelow was worried about traffic enforcement or response time and making sure we have enough time to cover or respond to violent crimes. Mayor Bigelow responded by saying yes. His concern is that we start to do more follow-up on routine crimes that always seem to drop down the list. Councilwoman Lang asked if he meant smaller crimes like car break ins or those things that citizens might be concerned about and if faster response times was what he was looking for? Mayor Bigelow replied yes. As we investigate or follow-up on crimes the citizen's will appreciate us more if we do so quicker, and it was Mayor Bigelow's opinion that if we follow-up on the minor crimes overall crime will decrease, plus he believes it will help with the image of the city. Councilwoman Lang asked if there was a specific number of police officers that we are "suppose to have"? Mayor Bigelow said no, that what he was looking at was what was happening in the city. Do we go out on every home break in? The general response in his opinion is that our officers will do that if they have time. Councilman Buhler asked if we would hire police officers until we do that? Mayor Bigelow replied that he discussed with Wayne that if we had more people could we constructively use them. His biggest

concern is that we have no plans to do anything more and he would like the City Manager to start to make plans to lessen the burden in the department, by hiring even someone out of high school like a cadet program where they would go out and talk to people because their home was broken in to and take the report, write it down, pat them on the back etc. Councilman Buhler commented that that was different than hiring a police officer. He agreed with a police officer support program but hiring officers just to hire officers to what end, is 10 enough? Mayor Bigelow feels that cadets would not carry a weapon and would be less expensive to hire. Councilman Huynh said that we also need to hire officers to handle cold cases as well. Councilwoman Lang said the day to day response is more important. Mayor Bigelow expressed to the City Manager that we are not responding to all the calls and therefore he was requesting that we make some progress to fix the problem, even it means hiring one additional officer or two retired officers or part time officers and they would not carry weapons but simply just start talking more to citizens. Mayor Bigelow said if we don't start we will never improve it. Councilman Buhler asked Mayor Bigelow what level of service did he think we needed to say that we have accomplished the goal, just something more, just keep hiring? Mayor Bigelow responded by saying if one hire is approved then it would be up to Wayne to determine how to use the person to the best advantage. Right now, sometimes the follow-up is several days to never, Mayor Bigelow said. He wants to test it, make the effort and see what the impact is first. "don't hire 10 people when 5 would work, Mayor Bigelow said.

Councilman Nordfelt voiced support for Mayor Bigelow's suggestion on the property tax increase that we do a tax increase every year in smaller increments rather than do larger increases. Maybe tie the increase to the consumer price index rather than waiting a few years and then suggest a larger increase. Councilwoman Lang said not sure which index we should look at to determine the increase and Councilman Nordfelt said perhaps the municipal price index would be better than the consumer price index. Councilman Nordfelt said that he thinks the trend overtime has followed the index anyway except we do it in big chunks rather than doing it year to year which is too much of a jolt for the citizens. Wayne agreed with Councilman Nordfelt that maybe there is a better way to give the council more confidence in how the money would be used if a tax increase were approved year after year. Mayor Bigelow talked about earmarking part of our growth with additional people whether it is an officer or part time. He said if we are not putting that in the budget we will continue to fall behind. Mayor Bigelow suggested that Wayne would decide the appropriate increase to be taken. If Wayne came back to the Council and said we need more people in parks and that is where we need to put the growth then ok, but Mayor Bigelow's personal preference would be to hire in the police department. Councilman Buhler said what would happen if we have growth of \$300K one year and the next year sales tax is down and we are just capitalizing on growth. Mayor Bigelow said we are going to ask anyway for a tax increase at some point in time, so why not use growth to provide services to the city something small every year whether it is for the police department or parks. Councilman said so we have a tax increase every year adjusted to inflation so that we can provide manpower at some level in any department that the City Manager sees fit. Mayor Bigelow said, but the direction of that comes from the Council. The instruction to the City manager would be use all available money to cover all costs providing more personnel and if there is not enough money then we do a tax increase, or we start taking it from fund reserves. Mayor Bigelow said we are trying to address some of these issues we are trying to say to the public the services are not free, to get the same service every year they have to pay a little more and we somewhat "train" them in that concept so that we continue to support the police, they will not stay if we don't continue to pay them Mayor Bigelow said.

Councilman Huynh requested that we help our senior citizens out by giving them a reduced rate on their storm water bill. Mayor Bigelow said since we don't have enough money to investigate crimes we should not be giving our citizens discounts unless the council says otherwise. Mayor Bigelow said that he would staff police first rather than staff the new fire station. Councilwoman Lang said that the police had other departments where police are needed as well. Mayor Bigelow said that he would like to say to Wayne we need more help in the police department and Wayne can decide how best to use the resources. But the goal is to reduce the response time on lower priority calls.

Councilman Buhler said he needed to give this more thought, didn't know how one or two more people would actually achieve the goal. Of course, we would like the best parks, roads, police force etc., but we have to prioritize all of that because he doesn't believe that just having a good police department and having bad roads and bad parks is the determining factor. We have to sort of lift everything up together. Mayor Bigelow said that we need to leave it up to Wayne to determine where the added people will do the most good or adds the most value. And where they add value is where they contribute to work which is not being done now the council concluded. It must be measured and visible improvement. It has to be something that is visible improvement to the public whether it is in parks, or police or any other department. Councilman Buhler said some things are important to one council member like putting together rape kits while other things are important to others. Mayor Bigelow said that the City Manager could decide where to utilize the people.

Councilman Huynh would like to include a discussion about incentives for the police department such as educational incentives, training etc., so that we can retain them and minimize their desire to move around to other departments. We pay out a large sum of money for training just to lose the officers to other agencies. If we can think of some incentives for them morale will be strengthened they will work harder and be happier. Mayor Bigelow said that he would like to address that issue as well but not initially, we can't solve every problem but we should start with things that are visible and measurable.

Councilman Buhler said we don't have enough votes among the council to vote for a tax increase one year let alone every year. We are wasting our time talking about it. Mayor Bigelow made a commitment to the rest of the Council that even though he has a long history of consistently and strongly avoiding tax increases if this is put in place and if the council is willing to earmark it he will vote for the tax increase every year. Councilwoman Lang asked if we could only earmark two officers would Mayor Bigelow still vote for a tax increase? Mayor Bigelow said that we should utilize the salary savings (a quarter of it) and use it as a pilot to get additional officers to reduce the call time then he would be supportive of a tax increase.

Wayne said that in 2011 in March we had authorized 190 positions and we had essentially 180 people on board so 10 vacancies. We had 65 people in patrol at that time. Our response time to priority one calls was 8 min 18 seconds. In 2015 during the same period we had 206 authorized positions with about 159 so 20 fewer because we had several officers in training or FTO and yet the response time was half, 4 min, therefore that implies that there are other factors that is reducing the response time than simply having more people in patrol. Mayor Bigelow said very likely. The follow-up question is should we be more careful assigning those positions to some other function? As a manager, you would want to know why the response times were cut in half basically with the same number of people in patrol 4 years later. Should we not be assigning those extra officers to some other function or some other benchmark. Mayor Bigelow said it had to be measurable and visible if you assigned the officers to the lower level

calls you would see a significant difference. What is the difference? The time that the calls are followed up on. The Council discussed the statistics which reflected actual response times. Councilwoman Lang said that while we know that these response times the citizens do not. The issue is where do we need to put the additional personnel, in patrol, on the gang unit? Mayor Bigelow said that while we could probably improve the response time but it will never show where we made the difference. Mayor Bigelow said he is looking for measurability and visibility and he would prefer cadets. Wayne said he liked the concept and is on board with the council's philosophy. Wayne discussed the visibility question. In 2015 the Chief was able to maintain the number of officers on patrol 69 vs. 65. In 2015 he had 27 officers in investigations and 28 in 2011 before he joined us. Specialty units like traffic, CSU we had 50 officers and in 2015 we had 29.5. The point Wayne was making was we had 2 officers in traffic and traffic enforcement, which would be visible to the citizens, was essentially non-existent. The Chief was instructed to organize a traffic unit. The citizens will begin to see that our officers are making our streets safer. But what will not be as visible but just as effective from a community crime reduction standpoint is those 20 or so positions in our community relations units who work directly with other departments like code enforcement. Those vacancies are being filled in that unit point being this is a very complex and wide ranging subject requiring study and adaptability. Mayor Bigelow agreed that in the long term there will be issues such as incentives, training and a host of other things that we cannot do now.

Wayne suggested that he could come back to the Council and say I could implement or put a portion of the growth and put it to new functions within the city which would measurably improve the city services whether it be a police officer, a park worker or a firefighter. The way we can measure that is to compare it against need. Because our authorized and effective strengths have been different over time we should recognize that as we replace employees in those areas including the 10 extra officers we have not been able to fill until now that we will increase both visibility and effectiveness within the respective functions and still staff station 76. Wayne recommends using the 1m dollars at the fire station rather than put it to police. That is certainly something that should be discussed but it also demonstrates the complexity of our options. Mayor Bigelow said that he was not going to change his mind. Wayne referred to Councilman Buhler's point that is going to confront the Council. No question the City Manager can get behind the concept of new money for new services and tax to maintain the services we have but it is a more difficult conversation for the council to have to determine the use of that new growth or cap. Mayor Bigelow said that he was doing this on purpose because he wants to do something he can see. While the fire department is important Mayor Bigelow said, he wants to do something for the Police department. Wayne asked for what reason is it not to improve the community in a visible and effective way? And both of those things can be achieved by supporting the fire concept as opposed to the police concept. Wayne recommends to council to be as flexible as possible. Councilwoman Lang asked why not police? Wayne felt that we can reduce the fire response times in the southwest area of Diamond Summit. It's not about giving money to fire over police. The point is we can improve the response time in general to the public which is visible and measurable. Councilwoman Lang said that the fire station would not be staffed for a couple of years. She suggested putting a million to police and 1 million to fire. We are going to build the station and we need to staff it, she said.

Councilwoman Lang wondered why, in the presentation with Parks and Rec, Mr. Astill asked for new employees. Why did the council have to approve that and Human Resources filled their vacancies without asking? If parks need two new employees why didn't Mr. Astill just ask the City Manager. The City Manager explained that in the case of Human Resources, the need existed to move positions

around from the finance department to better utilize the Human Resource Information system, (payroll). This was necessary not only to ensure that data entry from the old payroll system was accurately put into the new system. Councilwoman Lang recognized that the same thing happened in Administration by not filling the vacancies left in the recorders position the work was simply transferred to existing employees without effecting the budget. Councilman Buhler added that it is always best to determine where the needs are and make decisions to put employees where they can be better utilized or fit with the ever-changing dynamics of the City. That decision should be made at the executive level based on need, Councilman Buhler said. The bottom line budget is not effected nor is head count. Councilman Buhler said that is why he doesn't want to just hire 3 police officers without understanding what they will be doing, or explaining why 3 is the magic number and not more or less.

Mayor Bigelow said that he assumed from the start of the conversation that his desire to hire police officers would not be accepted which is ok but he had a specific reason. He mentioned that when he talks with citizens he has never heard from them that we need to improve the fire department response times. But I do hear that they are wonderful, they are always there, we call them and they come. I do hear from citizens who say that our police officers on the other hand, do not come. Councilman Buhler said we hear the same complaints from citizens about ordinance and Code, that we are not doing enough or they are not responding. Mayor Bigelow said that he arrived at his conclusions by asking himself which cause do I want to champion. He stated that while he loved parks and trails, the most important thing the city does is the police department. Councilman Buhler agreed but to back up his prior statement Councilman Buhler gave the example of Pioneer Valley Hospital. Citizens have always commented on the service they receive from the Hospital and many times they would often say they would never go there. Well Why? And they would say will 30 years this and this happen. It's the same stereotype that the police department has.

Mayor Bigelow asked the City Manager to report on the response times of the Police Department. The City Manager read to the Council the actual average response times of the Police Department broken down by call type. Mayor Bigelow then asked why the perception from the public is so different from what the actual data showed? My experience with the legislature tells me that these reports, even though they report great data that the reality is not true. The City Manager said that he was not making a determination whether it is great or not, it is what it is. The City Manager provided this analysis. There are 110K calls for service per year. Councilwoman Lang's example of the 8-hour call where we probably mishandled but that is one call in a thousand where we actually did show up in a legitimate amount of time and the citizens hardly ever call us and thank us for the quick response they don't do anything. When you average that type of response over time, and it doesn't mean that they aren't anecdotal exceptions like Councilman Buhler was saying, they are. Mayor Bigelow questioned that his reports about the public were anecdotal, but Wayne's point was that the data was there to back up the claim and it's not just casual observations. Councilwoman Lang said that perhaps it is the way they define the averages. She would like to know how many calls took 4-8 hours. Mayor Bigelow using an example at the legislature said that two studies brought two different conclusions, exactly the opposite. He does not doubt that the study or the measurements indicated can bring us to a conclusion but it does not mean that He accepts those conclusions. The City Manager understood the Mayor Bigelow's feelings and empathized with him that he relies more on face to face conversations with His constituents and perhaps less trustful of data. No way to get over that. The City Manager said he doesn't doubt the data or Mayor Bigelow's perception of the people's confidence in our department. It

wasn't just anecdotal the Mayor Bigelow said. The City Manager said if you have heard it 900 times it is still a small percentage when compared to the 110K calls we get, which seems to average out or validate the data. Mayor Bigelow said that the council can do otherwise but for him he will not change his mind. Councilman Nordfelt, said perhaps the data can be shown in a different way, histogram vs average for example.

The City Manager made it clear to Mayor Bigelow that he was not disagreeing with him at all. Mayor Bigelow said that he was very much aware that the focus of the Council right now is on the fire department. Councilwoman Lang reminded Mayor Bigelow that the issue of staffing at the fire department will not happen for two years. The City Manager said that he is all for the Council to focus attention on the Police Department this year as well. Councilwoman Lang referring to the calls made a comment that Police Officers needed to handle them not a cadet. Mayor Bigelow said certainly not a cadet, but perhaps a retired officer. You would want a cadet to do very safe things routine things and the city manager would direct that.

Councilman Huynh said he would be interested in the incentive we would use for cadets. He has talked with our officers and he knows that they are happy with our insurance, we are lower than Salt Lake City but we need to provide other incentive's like vacation, pay etc. if they stay with us. Even pay for second language skills would be good.

Councilwoman Lang said that last year the police department had 1.5 million in left over money for that year. So, if 17/18 is the same as it was last year then they should be able to take care of all the new hires. The City Manager said, no, there is no new money, that money will go to pay those officers who were already authorized last year. It is only one time money. Her point was that once we fill all the vacancies we can then measure the results see how traffic is being handled and then if needed do the tax increase and use that money as the new growth that Mayor Bigelow was talking about if we don't see improvement. The City Manager said that that was the same argument he had been making with the Chief for two years.

Mayor Bigelow said that was another approach to it and that is fine. Mayor Bigelow indicated that he wanted to do that on top of his suggestion that we hire more officers. We have to hold them accountable however, gang problems have gone down, no shootings this year, in other words Councilwoman Lang wants measurable and visible results with a full department before committing new resources. Mayor Bigelow alluded to an officer on every corner to which the City manager said that those problems occurred not because we didn't have an officer on every corner rather we were in the process of filling 20 vacancies in our specialty units. Councilwoman Lang said let's fill the vacancies, look at in another year and then after that evaluation determine where we go. Councilman Buhler agreed, he wanted to see what we will be like after we are fully staffed. If it goes better then we may not have to sock in another million, Councilwoman Lang said. The City Manager said even if we didn't some of the things Mayor Bigelow is talking about, adding capability to increase visibility can still be very helpful, and not that expensive.

Councilwoman Lang asked the cost of a new officer, (100,000 up front and then second year less). She said perhaps we take \$500,000 and hire 5 officers get our vacancies filled and if it works.

Mayor Bigelow indicated that he just wanted to bring up his idea and that council can revisit it whenever they would like, even after the fire department. Councilwoman Lang indicated that she would like to

see it happen before the fire department is staffed. The City Manager said that even outside of the data and the benchmarking what he was suggesting is happening already and has happened over the years. You never hear the Chief say thank you so much for the 5 and 10 and the 2-incremental people you added to the budget but you will hear I want more people, I need more incentives. Six years ago, we had 190 authorized positions. By September 13th, 2011, we had 194.5, by Feb 2015, a year and half later, we had 206 authorized positions. Incrementally what Mayor Bigelow is suggesting is happening anyway and it has always happened. If you measure our population growth vs. officer growth and call volume which has occurred our calls per officer is the same as it was 20 years ago. That does not mean we do not want to improve or get better but it does not imply that it is worse. Mayor Bigelow said he is not saying it is worse.

Mayor Bigelow said if he could he would earmark 75% of growth to the Police Department and just keep increase until we have in essence a police officer on every corner. Its overkill but I want overkill Mayor Bigelow said. I want to go far beyond what other cities do and make this without question the safest city not just in our state but beyond that. He realizes that he can't get there ultimately but he would like to at least head in that direction and adjust as we go along to see how it is working.

Councilman Nordfelt said that with the other two members of Council gone that the Council should not continue to speak about the focused priorities without them. Councilman Buhler added we could do that at a study meeting or after a regular meeting.

Council decided to do this the night of the 7th in study or after the regular meeting that evening.

Wayne summarized by saying we are taking the 6 overall objectives taking out taxation/budget and leaving in environment and then we review them to determine the priority of focus, and recap the notes from this meeting.

A motion to adjourn was made by Councilman Nordfelt and seconded by Councilman Buhler. The meeting was adjourned at 1:20.

I hereby certify the foregoing to be a true, accurate and complete record of the proceedings of the Strategic Planning Meeting of the West Valley City Council held Friday, February 24, 2017 and Saturday, February 25, 2017.

Paul Isaac
Assistant City Manager